Human Resources in Medical Organizations in the Republic of Kazakhstan

Zhuldyz Baiganova¹, Andrei Dubitskiy¹, Nailya DeLellis²

¹Department of Medicine, Astana Medical University, Astana, Kazakhstan, ²Doctor of Health Administration Program, The Herbert H. and Grace A. Dow College of Health Professions, USA

Abstract

Background: During two decades, Kazakhstan has been conducting various reforms, and specifically in the healthcare sector, which inherited the Soviet Union system. Timely implementation of governmental programs depends on the human resources (HR) potential opportunities. One of the main dimensions of healthcare system development is planning and establishing HR, based on the healthcare needs and requirements. National observatory of HR in health care was established for the realization of healthcare system development. The research that we had been conducted is dedicated for providing evaluation and assessment of the present HR performance and activity in healthcare organizations of the Republic of Kazakhstan. Aim: The aim of this research is to present critical evaluation and assessment of the present HR activities in healthcare organizations of the Republic of Kazakhstan. Result and Discussion: On analysis of research data, it was found out that there is an extreme need in elaboration and development of the HR institution capacity in Republic of Kazakhstan. Second, power base and establishment of the national observatory of HR in health care in Republican center for development can be mentioned as an upward trend. Conclusion: There is a demand in conducting professional training among HR managers in the perspective of providing talent pipeline for medical organizations and implementation of professional development programs HR in medical organizations.

Key words: Human resource management, Kazakhstan, motivation in health care, performance of healthcare services

INTRODUCTION

During two decades, Kazakhstan has been conducting various reforms, and specifically in the healthcare sector, which inherited the Soviet Union system. Timely implementation of governmental programs depends on the human resources (HR) potential opportunities. The question of the proper professional background and qualification of the management in healthcare organizations, and companies providing services in HR development becomes extremely important when making decisions in the management of the medical staff, their direct activities in the formation of high-quality HR potential of medical and nursing staff. The majority of studies proved that HR management plays an essential role in the quality of healthcare services development and improves the functioning of healthcare personnel by means of creation motivational and incentives system and tools, as well as a system of bonuses for competence.¹² Nowadays, the majority of researchers confirm the connection between the efficient work of HR management and productivity of the medical organization.³⁴ E. Denisova-Schmidt noted that there are two different categories of professionals in Kazakhstan: One with previous professional experience in the Soviet Union (or in today’s large Russian corporations that still retain elements of the Soviet corporate culture) and another - modern generation.

Address for correspondence:
Zhuldyz Baiganova, Astana Medical University, Astana, Kazakhstan. Tel: +77784611582.
E-mail: Z.Baiganova@gmail.com

Received: 22-11-2017
Revised: 09-12-2017
Accepted: 13-12-2017
Both groups have different expectations from their employers and different understanding of the job, motivation to work, and retention factors.\textsuperscript{[6]}

Thus, HR planning system became one of the main directions in the development of the healthcare system\textsuperscript{[7]} based on healthcare needs HR planning system is the key factor in resource-saving technologies implementation process. The creation of high-quality HR management is of particular importance. National observatory of HR in health care was established for realization of this task.\textsuperscript{[8]}

The aim of this research is to present critical evaluation and assessment of the present HR activities in healthcare organizations of the Republic of Kazakhstan.

**METHODS**

We developed a questionnaire based on a literature review. The key words are HR, capital, HR management, and candidate pool. Working group has generated two types of questionnaire with differentiated questions. The first questionnaire was dedicated for estimation and studies the opinion among staff of medical organizations (doctors, nurses, and other personnel – group 1) of the question of HR performance and functioning. The second questionnaire was dedicated for HR personnel in medical organizations (group 2). First, the surveys were tested among three medical organizations and also examined by two independent reviewers. The application of tested surveys was approved by Republican center for healthcare development.

Respondents were asked to select the most appropriate option for their opinion regarding the asked question. The survey was conducted anonymously using online Survey Monkey program. There is online database of addresses within the Republican center for healthcare development that was being used during research.

The survey was conducted in the second quarter of 2016. The participation in this survey was confidential and voluntary. We have conducted a sociological survey among 6143 people of the 1\textsuperscript{st} group, as well as 652 employees from the 2\textsuperscript{nd} group from 16 regions of Kazakhstan. Our study involved different representatives of almost all types of healthcare organizations in Kazakhstan. Types of medical organizations and the quantity of participants are represented in Table 1.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Type of health organization</th>
<th>Group 1</th>
<th>Group 2</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Organizations providing outpatient care</td>
<td>1191 (19.4)</td>
<td>158 (24.2)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Organizations providing inpatient care</td>
<td>1954 (31.8)</td>
<td>125 (19.2)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Organizations providing outpatient care and inpatient care</td>
<td>1580 (25.7)</td>
<td>195 (29.9)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Organizations emergency medical services and medical aviation</td>
<td>426 (6.9)</td>
<td>11 (1.7)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Organizations of rehabilitation treatment and medical rehabilitation</td>
<td>134 (2.2)</td>
<td>16 (2.5)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Organizations carrying out activities in the field of blood services</td>
<td>141 (2.3)</td>
<td>13 (2.0)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Scientific organizations and educational institutions in the sphere of healthcare</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>22 (3.4)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>National funds</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>4 (0.6)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Healthcare management organizations</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>66 (10.1)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Organizations of the private health sector, working on a voluntary insurance scheme</td>
<td>717 (11.7)</td>
<td>42 (6.4)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>6143 (100)</td>
<td>652 (100)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**RESULTS**

We have deduced that the majority of the 1\textsuperscript{st} group - 57.0\% of respondents believe that their career depends on the decision of the head, at the same time, the business and organizational competences and attitude to work are also taken into account. However, 23\% of the employees of the 1\textsuperscript{st} group do not know what determines their career growth.

Fifty three (4\%) of the respondents made a point that employee turnover rate is mostly average, 8.3\% of employees are willing to change jobs, in case of getting satisfying working conditions such as salary and position. 25.4\% of the 1\textsuperscript{st} group are ready to change their workplace [Table 2]. Employees of the HR department, respondents of the 2\textsuperscript{nd} group noted the presence of internal personnel reserve and 32.1\% and 38.8\% found it difficult to answer [Figure 1].

Forty seven (4\%) of the 1\textsuperscript{st} group respondents stated that work and process efficiency of the HR departments depends on the application of new technologies in their work [Table 2]. However, 34 (3\%) of respondents of the 1\textsuperscript{st} group pointed that the level of HR department is moderate, but still requires improvement in its efficiency.
At the same time, 52 (4%) from the 2nd group consider the implementation of HR management professional development programs in the sphere of health care is essential and feasible [Table 3]. 46 (4%) consider the best solution is to implement HR management professional development programs in local medical universities and 31 (5%) presume on engaging recent graduates from non-medical universities, mostly of HR management specialization to provide their services in HR development [Table 3]. It was also conducted that 55 (2%) of the respondents from the 2nd group are attending professional development courses in institutes that are not of medical specificity and other 54 (6%) in specialized medical institutions [Figure 2].
Currently, only 47 (6%) respondents from the 1st group and 35 (7%) from the 2nd group are satisfied with their wages and the possibility of career growth Table 4.

### DISCUSSION

In medical organizations, not all employees are aware of the career opportunities and types of motivation to apply for providing better quality medical care in healthcare organizations. Only 10% of respondents noted the possibility of creating a competitive commission based on objective criteria. At present, duties of HR department include: HR administration, consulting employees on various HR issues, reception, translation, and dismissal of employees. Participation in the development of job descriptions, planning the staffing needs for a short- and long-term period, development of the motivation system, organization of trainings, educational seminars, professional development training courses, the creation of a personnel reserve, monitoring of the labor market, informing the management of the company about the current market situation with the labor and the average wage, monitoring, and evaluation of individual performance of the personnel, development of corporate culture.
A third of the respondents of the 1st group are not satisfied with their daily activities and in the case of better conditions are ready to change their place of work, moreover more than 65% of the healthcare organizations does not have the talent pool or personnel reserve. It is also important that 38.8% of the 2nd group is not informed about the personnel reserve in their organization. That is a big risk for the medical organizations representing aid for the population; organizations have a risk of failure timely provided medical care. Satisfaction regarding the wage rate and career growth factors is very low in both groups, which could be probably caused by the absence of motivation mechanisms for improvement that is also comprise the risk for healthcare organizations. In the framework of the state program of the Republic of Kazakhstan - Densaulyk, proposed governmental - private partnership is contemplated as a tool for the development a competitive medicine. In this regard, it is important to take into account the role of motivation of HR development, which is an integral part of the productivity of the medical organizations.

CONCLUSION

Nowadays, the HR department requires the improvement of working processes and motivational instruments, as well as implementation of new educational programs. Lack of motivation among the HR managers becomes a risk factor for stagnation and suspension of the development of capacity in this sector, resulting in the incapability of the implementation of innovation and resource-efficient technologies in the medical organization.

REFERENCES


Source of Support: Nil. Conflict of Interest: None declared.